

**THE UNITED CHURCH OF CANADA
TORONTO CONFERENCE**

**Minutes of a meeting of the
Sub-Executive of Toronto Conference
Wednesday, November 1, 2017
Thursday, November 2, 2017
Monday, November 20, 2017, and
Tuesday, November 21, 2017**

The sub-Executive of Toronto Conference met at the South West Presbytery/Toronto Conference office on Wednesday, November 1, 2017. The meeting began at 9:30 a.m. A quorum was present.

Present: Audrey Brown (President), Bryan Ransom (Past-President), Jody Maltby (Executive Secretary), Sharon Aylsworth (Toronto Southeast), Henry MacLeod (South West), Lawrence Nyarko (diversity)

Regrets: Angus MacLennan (Living Waters), Thérèse Samuel (Northern Waters)

Corresponding members

Linda Anderson (reviewer), Bob Bingham, Cindy Randall (South West Presbytery), Gail Cook-Bennett, David Dallimore, Gary Halpenny, Steve McCorquodale, Joan Schettler, Murray Smith, Deborah Turnbull, Mark Winger (Humber Valley United Church, Etobicoke)

Visitors

Barbara Clarke, Ron Crago, Dennis Schettler (Humber Valley United Church, Etobicoke)

Preparation for discussion of review

The sub-Executive met at 9:30 a.m. to identify questions it wished to ask of the various parties involved in the review of Humber Valley United Church, Etobicoke and the Rev. Mark Winger. The President offered prayer.

Opening

At 10:00 a.m. President, Audrey Brown welcomed everyone to the meeting, and called the meeting to order in the name of Jesus Christ. She asked people to introduce themselves and offered prayer.

Corresponding members

MOTION by Sharon Aylsworth/Lawrence Nyarko that the corresponding members of this meeting be Linda Anderson, reviewer, and those making presentations regarding the review of Humber Valley United Church and the Rev. Mark Winger.

MOTION

CARRIED

Receipt of report

MOTION by Bryan Ransom/Henry MacLeod that the sub-Executive receive the report (Appendix A) of the review of Humber Valley United Church, Toronto and the report (Appendix B) of the review of the Rev. Mark Winger.

MOTION

CARRIED

Correspondence

The President explained that an item of correspondence had been received from Sheila Murray who was quoted in the report.

MOTION by Sharon Aylsworth/Lawrence Nyarko that the correspondence (Appendix C) be received for information.

MOTION

CARRIED

Discussion with Linda Anderson

The sub-Executive heard from the reviewer, Linda Anderson. Sub-Executive members asked questions of Linda. The President thanked Linda for her work, and Linda Anderson left the meeting.

Review – response from South West Presbytery

Bob Bingham and Cindy Randall provided a response (Appendix D) to the report prepared by Linda Anderson. Sub-Executive members asked questions, and the President thanked the South West Presbytery representatives.

Review – response from Humber Valley United Church, Etobicoke

Deborah Turnbull and Gary Halpenny, members of Humber Valley United Church, Etobicoke provided a response (Appendix E) to the report prepared by Linda Anderson. Sub-Executive members asked questions; the President thanked the Humber Valley members.

The members of South West Presbytery left the meeting.

Review – response from individual members of Humber Valley United Church, Etobicoke

David Dallimore, Murray Smith, Gail Cook-Bennett on behalf of Peter White, Joan Schettler, Gary Halpenny on behalf of two members Ted Loewen and Fred Torrie, Constance Crosby, Deborah Turnbull on behalf of two members Donna McCorquodale and Judith Dallimore, and Steve McCorquodale, members of Humber Valley United Church, Toronto, provided a both an oral and written response to the recommendations in the report prepared by Linda Anderson. Joan Belford provided a written response. No response was provided from Wendy Oliver. All individual written responses are found at Appendix F. Executive members asked questions; the President thanked the Humber Valley members.

Lunch

The sub-Executive broke for lunch at 11:55 a.m. The President offered grace and the meeting resumed at 12:45 p.m. at which time the sub-Executive continued to hear responses from members of Humber Valley United Church.

Concluding matters

The Executive Secretary explained the decision-making process; the sub-Executive will continue to meet and make their final decisions. These will be communicated by the Executive Secretary to Humber Valley United Church during a congregational meeting on November 26, 2017 and to Mark Winger prior to that.

The president offered a blessing and the representatives of Humber Valley United Church left the meeting.

Review – response from Mark Winger

Mark Winger provided an oral response to the report prepared by Linda Anderson. Sub-Executive members asked questions; the President thanked Mr. Winger.

The president offered a blessing and Mr. Winger left the meeting.

Deliberations

The President offered prayer. Having heard from the various parties, the sub-Executive began its deliberations.

Adjournment

The sub-Executive agreed to adjourn the meeting and reconvene at 10:00 a.m. on November 2, 2017.

The President expressed appreciation to members of the sub-Executive and the staff for their work to date. She offered a blessing. The meeting adjourned at 4:05 p.m.

Thursday, November 2, 2017

Reconvening and Deliberations

The sub-Executive reconvened Thursday, November 2, 2017 beginning at 10:15 a.m. The President offered prayer. The sub-Executive continued its deliberations.

The sub-Executive broke for lunch at 12:15 p.m. The President offered grace.

The sub-Executive determined that there were further questions for Mark Winger and agreed to reconvene at a later date to have further conversations with him.

Minutes

MOTION by Bryan Ransom/Henry MacLeod that the minutes of the sub-Executive meeting of September 27, 2017 be approved as circulated.

MOTION

CARRIED

Henkel Appeal

The Executive Secretary provided an update on the Appeal of a decision of Northern Waters Presbytery.

MOTION by Henry MacLeod/Lawrence Nyarko in the matter of the Appeal of Michael Henkel of the decision of the Education & Students Commission of Northern Waters Presbytery May 3 and June 27, 2017, that the date to receive a completed report from the Appeal Committee be extended to March 31, 2018 and the budget be increased from \$2,000 to \$12,000 to allow for the expenses of a hearing.

MOTION

CARRIED

Vosper Formal Hearing

The Executive Secretary provided an update on the Vosper formal hearing.

Adjournment

The President offered a blessing. The meeting adjourned at 2:15 p.m.

Monday, November 20, 2017**Reconvening**

The sub-Executive reconvened on Monday, November 20, 2017 at 1:00 p.m. Mark Winger joined the sub-Executive. The President opened with prayer. Mr. Winger provided a further response to the sub-Executive (Appendix G) and responded to questions posed by the members of the sub-Executive. Mr. Winger left the meeting at 2:15 p.m.

Deliberations

The sub-Executive continued its deliberations. Upon completing its deliberations, the sub-Executive agreed to take 24 hours to sit with the proposed decisions and to reconvene by conference call on Tuesday, November 21, 2017 at 3:30 p.m.

J9 Review

The Executive Secretary reported that she and the Conference Personnel Minister met with the President and the Chair of Settlement and Pastoral Relations to consider the recommendation to conduct a J9 review of Rev. Shawn Ankenmann. (Appendix H)

MOTION by Bryan Ransom/Sharon Aylsworth that the sub-Executive of Toronto Conference...

1. agree to conduct a review of Rev. Shawn Ankenmann in accordance with Section J9 of *The Manual*; and
2. appoint Patty Evans to conduct the review.

MOTION

CARRIED.

Adjournment

The President offered a blessing. The meeting adjourned at 3:45 p.m.

Tuesday, November 21, 2017**Reconvening**

The sub-Executive reconvened at 3:34 p.m. on Tuesday, November 21. The President opened with prayer.

Decisions

As stated in the Findings on page 18 of the Review of Humber Valley United Church “a deep and destructive conflict has escalated for many years between a group of influential and dedicated members and the minister.” The sub-Executive heard further evidence of the conflict during the presentations on November 1. Both parties focused on the other’s role with no personal accountability. The sub-Executive also heard evidence of conflict within the pastoral charge itself that is focused on the ministry personnel. The sub-Executive believes that both the pastoral charge and the ministry personnel would be better served to work on conflict resolution independently and then each move into a new pastoral relationship with fresh perspective.

There is a great deal of work that needs to be done to lessen the tension and establish a new circumstance where the pastoral charge can focus on its calling to be a missional church working for and with the community. It was evident to the sub-Executive that the situation has been very stressful for both the ministry personnel and the pastoral charge. In the sub-Executive’s opinion, based on what it has read in the two reports and what it has heard, the working relationship between the pastoral charge and the minister is not repairable, as is the current governance system.

Having heard from the various parties and with prayerful consideration, the sub-Executive made the following decisions related to the review of Humber Valley United Church and the Rev. Mark Winger:

Regarding the pastoral relationship

MOTION by Henry MacLeod/Sharon Aylsworth that the sub-Executive of Toronto Conference...

1. end the pastoral relationship between Mark Winger and Humber Valley United Church, Toronto effective November 30, 2017 with no further service required at Humber Valley United Church, Toronto or functioning as ministry personnel during the period November 30, 2017 – June 30, 2018;
2. direct Humber Valley United Church, Toronto to pay Mark Winger’s salary and benefits until June 30, 2018;
3. encourage Humber Valley United Church, Toronto, Mark Winger and South West Presbytery to work on an appropriate time to say goodbye; and
4. request South West Presbytery to ensure that pastoral support is available for Mark Winger during this time of transition.

MOTION

CARRIED

Remedial work

MOTION by Henry MacLeod/Lawrence Nyarko that the sub-Executive of Toronto Conference

- 1) That, by June 30, 2018 Mark Winger shall complete the following:
 - at least one workshop/course in understanding interpersonal conflict and conflict resolution process;
 - at least one workshop/course in leadership style, particularly understanding of group dynamics and human relationships; and
 - engage in intentional spiritual direction with an approved Spiritual Director.
- 2) That the Conference Personnel Minister work with Mark Winger in light of the issues identified in the Review.

The Conference Personnel Minister will support Mark in choosing the workshops/courses and in identifying learnings from these courses.

The Conference Personnel Minister shall decide by June 30, 2018 whether the remedial work shall be considered to be completed effectively, shall continue or be declared ineffective and terminated.

- 3) That the period for the remedial work may be extended by a maximum of two months upon recommendation of the Conference Personnel Minister, and that Toronto Conference assume any salary and benefits costs for the additional two months, if necessary.
- 4) Upon completing the remedial work by June 30, 2018 to the satisfaction of the Conference Personnel Minister in consultation with the sub-Executive, that Mark Winger be eligible for a call as of July 1, 2018 and that he be able to search for a call while completing his remedial work.
- 5) That Toronto Conference provide the funds necessary for the remedial work as approved by the Conference Personnel Minister in consultation with the Executive Secretary, such funds to come from the Conference Fund.

MOTION

CARRIED.

Regarding Humber Valley United Church

MOTION by Lawrence Nyarko/Sharon Aylsworth that the sub-Executive of Toronto Conference

- 1) Directs the Toronto Conference Settlement & Pastoral Relations Committee to appoint an Intentional Interim Minister for a minimum of two years for Humber Valley United Church,
- 2) That South West Presbytery appoint a supervising minister for Humber Valley United Church until the Intentional Interim Minister is in place;
- 3) That the members of the congregation be engaged in clarifying the Humber Valley United Church vision and mission, emphasizing its goals for the next three years;
- 4) That the Interim Minister assist the Board and congregation in dealing with governance, conflict, healing, reconciliation, and communication in ways that in the opinion of the Interim Minister seem appropriate to the situation and are for the long-term health of the congregation;
- 5) That the Interim Minister assist the Board to develop a governance model, including a nomination process, appropriate to their situation with established terms of office that would be adhered to;
- 6) That the current leadership of the Board and Ministry & Personnel Committee be changed within an 18-month period; and
- 7) that members of the new Ministry and Personnel committee receive adequate training and support to carry out their responsibilities effectively;
- 8) by June 30, 2018 all staff will receive an annual review with input from a variety of respondents, including other staff;
- 9) That no call or appointment be approved until Humber Valley United Church has demonstrated to the satisfaction of South West Presbytery that the congregation and staff have worked on the requirements emerging from this review.

MOTION

CARRIED.

Closing

With the business of the meeting completed, the President declared the meeting ended at 4:14 p.m. She offered a blessing.

Audrey Brown
President

Jody Maltby
Executive Secretary